

**Participants :** Marc Benoît MB, Cécile Bessou CB, Pierre-Marie Bosc PMB, Marc-Philippe Carron MPC, Emmanuelle Cheyngs EC, Marcel Djama MD (visio), Laurène Feintrenie LF (visio), Claude Jannot CJ, Margot Moulin MM, Patrice Levang PL (visio), Alain Rival AR, Julie Wohlfahrt JW.

**Absents :** Jean-Pierre Caliman JPC, Sylvain Rafflegeau SR, Jean-Marc Roda JMR, Aude Verwilghen AV

**Agenda**

Objectives of the meeting

1. To define the assessment grids for the characterisation of the production systems and their 3D-impacts
2. To define the survey questionnaires based on the content of the grids and to plan internships in 2013
3. To coordinate WP1 and WP2 notably in terms of research places and internships

+ Miscellaneous: visa, webpages, next steps

**Achievement**

The first objective was partly achieved: roughly 60% of the assessment grids were drafted based on WAW indicators. The second objective was partly achieved (50%): the number of internships and their timing were defined but the survey questionnaires have not been written down yet. The third objective was achieved through decisions on the location and coordinated internships for coordinated activities between WP1 and WP2; notably T1.2 & T2.1; T2.1 & T2.2. The use of the collaborative webpage "Alfresco share SPOP" was introduced to the participants. This collaborative webpage should be connected soon to the SPOP webpage but can already be used as such by SPOP people. An access was created for SPOP people who are not part of CIRAD.

Project benchmarking:

- Peter Oosterveer, Wageningen University, supervises 8 Ph.D. students from Asia to investigate the issue of land pressure related to palm oil development in Africa.
- SHARP is an initiative from RSPO that aims to define a good and efficient model of cooperation between industrial companies and smallholders. It is facilitated by ProForest and involves OLAM, Sime Darby and Sawit Watch (list to be completed).

Administrative points:

- SPOP project duration was extended by 6 months in order to encompass the 3-year duration of Margot Moulin's Ph.D. that started in November 2012 (INRA).
- The administrative process to get a research visa in Indonesia for both interns and Ph.D. students have changed lately and become more complicated. It is important to notice that an Indonesian counterpart is now needed to fulfill the administrative requirements. CIFOR can help conduct the whole process, provided that the supervisors (SPOP people) first compile all the required documents including the pieces that must be provided by the Indonesian counterpart.
- Raymond Ngonkho research work in Indonesia was delayed due to the difficulty to get his visa and the refusal from PT-SMART regarding his hostage. He should have his complete visa soon and will start investigating two companies: Musim Mas in Riau and PT Mega Sawindo in Jambi.
- An official invitation letter was sent to Dr. Fahmuddin Agus (Indonesian Soil Research Institute) who agreed to be part of the steering committee of Margot Moulin's Ph.D. thesis. He will help proceed with her visa demand.
- Agenda for the interns in 2013 should be coordinated so that interns can help each other in the field. Interns should take Bahasa classes at the same time if possible and investigations in the field should be combined as much as possible in order to foster synergies. It is also paramount that interns paid by CIRAD or CIFOR through SPOP budget receive the same amount of money including allowances and accommodation fees.

**Discussion points** Presentation of Margot Moulin's Ph.D. thesis "Modeling the diversity of palm oil development dynamics":

- There is a need to assess how the diverse palm oil systems may be sustainable within two dimensions: 1) a spatial dimension at both small (plantation) and large scales (mill supply area); and 2) a time dimension, since both present and future developments are of interest to the project. To predict potential future developments, the aim of the thesis is first to understand the past and current dynamics of the development of the diverse palm oil systems within the land system. The dynamics of land system (LUCC) are complex due to numerous interacting factors such as bio-geo-chemical and human processes. The analysis of these factors will feed the multi-agent model built-up during the thesis as a tool to simulate prospective scenarios of palm oil development in Sumatra. Details on the modeling plan and Ph.D. schedule can be found in the pdf of the presentation posted on Alfresco.

Field work:

- See internship list below
- SR specified that he will work on data from a former intern during 2013-Q1 to contribute to T1.4
- First reflexives workshop will be organised by MD in 2013. The bottom-line is to involve stakeholders in the critical review of the 3D-impact assessment grids. This participative process aims i) to communicate on SPOP objectives and potentially get stakeholders on board so that they can feel involved in the project and interested in using its outputs; ii) to establish the soundness of the assessment grids according to stakeholders' knowledge and needs, and to modify, complete and validate the grids; iii) to identify obstacles to the diffusion of project results and to the use of proposed quantified indicators. This workshop should be held while SPOP members are in Indonesia supervising interns in the field (i.e April-Mai 2013) so that they can participate in the workshop. It is paramount to well select the participants among the potential stakeholders, since their contribution to the workshop has to be critical but also constructive.

Potential bottlenecks/opened questions:

- According to Alice Baudoin's report: 8 types of palm oil systems are distinguished, i.e. PTP/PIR(-Trans)/KKPA-KUD high investment/Ophir/Semi-independent/independent/Joint venture/KKPA low investment (see Alice Baudoin's report in Alfresco for more details). In a first step, these 8 types will be investigated separately. The first question consists in

determining if similar palm oil cropping systems (notably agricultural practices) can be found across diverse systems among the 8 types above-mentioned ("ubiquist" cropping system) or if some cropping systems are specific to one of the 8 types ("niche" cropping system). Among "ubiquist" cropping systems, it is then necessary to investigate whether further factors (apart from palm oil cropping system) may affect the palm oil 3D-impacts in a systemic way so that palm oil systems can be further discriminated. According to the answers, the 8 types of palm oil systems may be re-combined and/or re-defined.

- Within SPOP project, emphasis is put on "palm oil cropping system". Nevertheless, the 3D assessment grids must be completed at the farm level, especially due to intrinsic inter-connections between palm oil, other productions and overall global socio-economic impacts. While the description of the diverse systems will be done at the farm level (structural indicators of the farm organisation), the assessment of agricultural performances and environmental impacts will be focused on palm oil systems (impact indicators at the plot(s) scale). Difficulties may arise 1) when differentiating structural or performance indicators for socio-economic aspects; and 2) when putting into perspective or weighting impacts only linked to palm oil or related to other productions or activities.
- By extension, in the assessment grids, indicators should be included that allow for distinguishing direct and indirect impacts from a palm oil cropping/production system, *i.e.* how to account for impacts on local population livelihoods related to the influential area of a palm oil plantation? This question also raises the issue of delineating this kind of influential area.
- Concerning the first reflexives workshop: it might be too complex to ask the invited stakeholders to revise the complete 3D-assessment grids. A set of more specific questions may be needed.

Responsible people/timing

- ♦ Project benchmarking: contacts will be taken with P. Oosterveer, SHARP members and further representatives from on-going projects related to palm oil production and sustainability assessments. CB+AR/2013-S1  
EC for SHARP/2013-S1
- ♦ Yves Laumonier (CIFOR) will be contacted by EC in order to clarify the potential role of local NGOs to help facilitating the visa demand. EC /2013-S1
- ♦ Reflexives workshop: a letter presenting SPOP and the assessment grids/proposed indicators will be sent to MD in order for him to start looking for participants to the workshop while he is in Indonesia. CB/2013-01
- ♦ Communication cell:
  - A request will be submitted to upgrade Alfresco share in order to be able to export uploaded documents toward a bibliographic tool such as Endnote or Zotero. CB/2013-01
  - Connection between SPOP web page and Alfresco share SPOP in under construction. B. Girardot/2013-?
- ♦ Administrative points:
  - A mail will be sent to Gilles St-Martin, regional representative of CIRAD in South-East Asia to inform him about interns planning and bottlenecks for visa demands. CB+AR/2013-01
- ♦ Steering committee: an invitation letter presenting SPOP and inviting people to contribute to SPOP steering committee still need to be sent to the institutional representatives and scientific department directors of the diverse partners + institutional representatives of local partners. Members of this committee will be then informed about SPOP updates and potentially provide feedbacks on a yearly basis. SPOP coordinators with the help of local contacts
- ♦ Technical committee:
  - ⇒ Next meeting Tuesday 8. January 2013, 9 am (Paris time)

## Decisions

## Interns planning

	State	Country	Timing	Supervisors	Objectives
I.1	Done by Alice Baudoin	Indonesia	2012/ Summer	CB + PMB	Literature review on the palm oil production systems found in Indonesia and review of interests to select the provinces and districts for SPOP field work.
I.2	Selection of candidate ongoing	Indonesia	2013/ 05-09	LF + PL	Palm oil supply chain analysis in the selected district of Riau Province Prospective workshop to define the global scenarios of palm oil development (T2.1)
I.3	Internship proposal to be published	Indonesia	2013/ 05-09	EC	Investigating the perception of global changes by diverse palm oil actors and local population (T1.2)
I.4	Internship proposal to be published	Indonesia	2013/ 04-09	CJ + CB	Assessing the 3D impacts of the diverse cropping systems (T1.4)
I.5?	Internship to be defined (Malaysian student?)		2013/ 04-05	MD	Reflexives to complete/validate the assessment grids with local actors (+ analyzing the perception of global changes by local actors)
I.6?	Internship to be defined	Cameroon	2013/14	SR (+ RN?)	Assessing the 3D impacts of the diverse cropping systems (T1.4)
I.7?	Internship to be defined	Indonesia	2013/14	Ph.D. student at INRA (+JW, JMR)	Model build-up and land use scenarios modeling (T2.2 + T2.3)

**Documents to be uploaded on Alfresco web:**

- 1 power point as pdf on MM Ph.D. (by MM) in File [Margot Moulin]
- 1 report as pdf on Alice Baudoin's literature review on palm oil systems (by CB) in File [SPOP INTERNSHIPS]
- 1 draft of the assessment grids (by CB) in File [SPOP DOCS]